What do restaurant grades really mean?

You think you know but...
Every restaurant in New York City has a grade. And lots of people decide where to eat based on grades. But what do they really mean? And where do they come from? The Center for Urban Pedagogy (CUP) worked with teaching artist Leigh Davis and students from the Lyons Community School to get the dirt behind the letters. They went out into the city to interview lots of people (health inspectors, chefs, consultants, and politicians) on making the grade.

It all begins when the city’s Department of Health makes a surprise inspection at a restaurant to see if there are any food safety or sanitation violations.
The inspector is looking for violations, like:

- Over 100 mouse droppings
- Using the bathroom without washing hands
- Leaking cans
- Failure to wash hands after sneezing
- Live roaches present in food areas
- ‘Wash hands’ not posted
- Mouse poop

For each violation, the restaurant gets points. The worse the violation, the more points the restaurant gets.

- 1-10 mouse droppings: 5 points
- 11-30 mouse droppings: 6 points
- 30-70 mouse droppings: 7 points
- 71-100 mouse droppings: 8 points
- Over 100 mouse droppings: 28 points

At the end of the inspection, the inspector adds up all the points.
The restaurant gets a grade based on the number of points, according to a scale.

There’s a pretty big range of points within each grade! A “C” grade can mean this:

- over 30 flies in one area (including trash area)

Or this:

- two or more live rodents

“You could have a C with 28 points, but your neighbor could have a C with 75 points. People see C in the window; they get scared and don’t want to go into the place. If it was up to me, I’d probably change the grading system to have A, A-, B+, B…”

—Michael Kelly, Restaurant Consultant
“I think it’s a good system. It challenges chefs and owners to do things the right way. The [inspectors] that come in are always smart and really know what’s right and wrong.”

—James Kent, Chef, Eleven Madison Park

“Seems straightforward, right?

Some things can put a restaurant at a disadvantage. For example, the size and type of restaurant can make a real difference:

The system is slightly fair, but it could be better. An example being a restaurant that serves one coffee versus a big kitchen in a restaurant in a hotel. The smaller the restaurant, the easier to get an A.”

—Chanette Perry, Inspector, Department of Health
It also matters how much money the restaurant has to begin with.

Some restaurants hire lawyers to fight violations in court so they can bring their grade up.

“‘You’re buying a VOWEL—It’s like wheel of fortune!’”
—Frank, Bagelsmith

“We represent over 13,000 restaurants in court. When they get the violations we go to court and try to change their grades if they didn’t get an ‘A’ on the first time.”
—Michael Kelly, Restaurant Consultant

Some restaurants hire consultants to help them prepare for inspections.
Restaurants could be at a disadvantage depending on where they are located.

“When we say borough bias, we believe that the city made a calculated effort to target businesses in the outer boroughs for revenue. They inspect a business, find a violation, and then collect revenue. What they did was target areas with language barriers and people with fewer resources to fight back.”

—Lydon Sleeper, Deputy Public Advocate

“Big restaurants have the advantage: they have money. Money solves a lot of problems. So when they build a restaurant, they build a restaurant up to standards, by design they’re in a very good position to get an ‘A’. Restaurants going into older buildings walk into a lot of hurdles: almost every building in the East Village probably has a mice problem.”

—Evan Huang, Co-owner of BaoHaus
Here’s what some of the people we interviewed had to say about the grading system and whether it’s fair:

“It’s very fair.”
—Bryant Washington, DOH NYC Sanitarian

“Its arbitrary. It’s geared towards revenue generation and not towards cleanliness, and that is wrong.”
—Lydon Sleeper, Deputy Public Advocate

“The grading system is fair, but the enforcement is not. It’s inconsistent.”
—Evan Huang, BaoHaus

“I think it’s pretty fair. I think it’s good to show people how the team is working. A place that has a C is not keeping food properly.”
—James Kent, Eleven Madison Park

“I think it’s arbitrary. It’s geared towards revenue generation and not towards cleanliness, and that is wrong.”
—Lydon Sleeper, Deputy Public Advocate

The Center for Urban Pedagogy (CUP) is a nonprofit organization that uses the power of art and design to increase meaningful civic engagement.

CUP’s Urban Investigations are project-based afterschool programs in which public high school students explore fundamental questions about how the city works. Students collaborate with CUP and teaching artists to create multimedia teaching tools that reach audiences in the fields of arts and social justice.

To learn more about CUP, visit welcometoCUP.org

Lyons Community School is a small school in East Williamsburg, Brooklyn, committed to providing a broad, stimulating experience in the liberal arts, and preparing students for college, healthy adulthood, and life-long learning.

CUP teaching artist: Leigh Davis
CUP project lead: Valeria Mogilevich
CUP project support: Sam Holleran, Jeff Kasper, Oscar Nunez
Booklet design: Sam Holleran
Lyons students: Joshua Arroyo, Gipsy Bisono Ramirez, Dayquan Cogdoll, Jason Fernandez, Armanie Fing, Jamal Grainger, Aimee Hernandez, Yuleidy Lugo, Erica Marshall, Esmerlyn Mesa Regla, Kimberly Ponce, Justino Rodriguez, Chardhil Spratley, Gabriella Tinsley, Cristian Tolentino, Jonathan Trivino
Lyons classroom teacher: Peter Litman

Thanks to our interviewees: Bryant Washington, Chanette Perry, and Shana Beasley (Department of Health and Mental Hygiene), James Kent (Eleven Madison Park), Michael Kelly, Evan Huang (BaoHaus), Lydon Sleeper (Public Advocate Bill de Blasio’s office), and all those East Williamsburg restaurants!

Big thanks to: Clara Amenyo, Sandra Di Capua, Brindalyn Webster Chen, Kristen Chin, Jessica Evans, Francis Lam, Jamie Mirabella, North Star Fund, Michelle Sosa

This project is made possible by public funds from the New York City Department of Cultural Affairs in partnership with the City Council.

© 2013, The Center for Urban Pedagogy (CUP)